

# Disease, Disaster, & Democracy

## *The public's stake in health emergency planning*

### U.S.–Canada summit

---

## background

Modern society's ability to handle potentially catastrophic health events hinges on the integrity of contingency planning, as well as the foresight to prevent and mitigate such devastation.

Plans for public health emergencies, however, are more than operational playbooks for saving lives and livelihoods. They are also a social contract—a rallying call and promise to protect the populace.

Disaster plans hold both practical and moral value. This fact is most apparent in the case of large-scale disease outbreaks such as SARS or pandemic flu because of their broad-reaching medical, social, political, and economic effects.

Regrettably, human tragedies associated with Hurricane Katrina have called into question our collective resolve and capacity—in and out of government—to take care of one another. Public trust in disaster policy is far from certain, particularly among marginalized groups whose needs often go unmet.

We believe that community and citizen engagement prior to and during a health disaster is essential to ensure that preparedness, response, and recovery plans reflect the realities of the people they intend to protect *and* command their confidence and trust.

---

## purpose

To advise leaders in government, public health, and disaster management on the feasibility and benefits of actively engaging citizens in planning for large-scale health emergencies, in anticipation of (1) the ethical dilemmas posed by scarce life-saving medical resources and (2) the logistical difficulties of protecting the well and caring for the sick in large numbers.

---

### **8:30–8:40 a.m. Opening Remarks**

Monica Schoch–Spana, PhD, Senior Associate, Center for Biosecurity of UPMC; Chairperson, Working Group on Citizen Engagement in Public Health Emergency Planning

### **8:40–8:50 a.m. Welcome and Keynote Introduction**

Tara O’Toole, MD, MPH, CEO and Director, Center for Biosecurity of UPMC

### **8:50–9:10 a.m. Keynote Address: *Why the Public’s Trust and Help Matter in Health Emergencies***

D.A. Henderson, MD, MPH, Distinguished Scholar, Center for Biosecurity of UPMC; Professor of Public Health and Medicine, University of Pittsburgh; former Director, World Health Organization’s Global Smallpox Eradication Campaign

### **9:10–9:20 a.m. Q&A**

### **9:20–10:10 a.m. Panel I: *What Government Gains by Engaging the Public***

Why should government officials care about community and citizen engagement? What are the enabling conditions for engagement? How can authorities bring citizens and communities into policy decisions and actions regarding health emergencies? How do citizen engagement methods differ from “crisis communications?” How have public health and homeland security officials sought to involve the public in their missions?

Moderator: Monica Schoch–Spana, PhD

#### *What Does ‘Public Involvement’ Mean?*

Mary Pat MacKinnon, MPA, Director of Public Involvement, Canadian Policy Research Networks

#### *A National Charter for Hometown Security*

Karen Marsh, Director, Citizen Corps, U.S. Department of Homeland Security

#### *Citizen Engagement at the Public Health Agency of Canada*

Élaine Chatigny, Director General for Communications, Public Health Agency of Canada

### **10:10–10:30 a.m. Q&A**

### **10:30–10:45 a.m. Break**

### **10:45–11:35 a.m. Panel II: *Show Me! An Inside Look at Citizen Engagement***

How has public involvement already been integrated into disaster mitigation and public health preparedness? What have been the positive outcomes of these initiatives? What are some exemplary citizen engagement programs, and why have they been successful? How might their approaches be replicated more broadly?

Moderator: Denise Gray–Felder, President and CEO, Communication for Social Change Consortium; former Vice President and Director of Communications, The Rockefeller Foundation

#### *Grassroots Hazards Management in Tornado Alley*

Ann Patton, Founding Director of Tulsa Partners, Inc.; former Director of Project Impact and the Citizen Corps Council for the City of Tulsa, Oklahoma

#### *The Public’s Take on ‘Who’s First in Line for Pandemic Flu Vaccine?’*

Roger Bernier, PhD, MPH, Co–Chair, Public Engagement Pilot Project on Pandemic Influenza; Senior Advisor for Scientific Strategy and Innovation, National Center for Immunization and Respiratory Disease, U.S. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention

#### *A Bayou Community’s Cultural and Physical Survival Before and After Katrina*

Rev. Kristina Peterson, MDiv, Founding Member, Grand Bayou Families United; Presbyterian Disaster Assistance Volunteer; Doctoral Student, Center for Hazards Assessment, Response and Technology at the University of New Orleans

### **11:35–11:55 a.m. Q&A**

## **11:55 a.m.–12:15 p.m. Break and Lunch Pick-Up**

## **12:15–12:45 p.m. Lunch Session: *Polio as the People's Disease***

David Oshinsky, PhD, George Littlefield Professor of American History, University of Texas at Austin; Author of the Pulitzer-Prize Winning Historical Account, *Polio: An American Story*

Introduced by Thomas V. Inglesby, MD, COO and Deputy Director, Center for Biosecurity of UPMC

## **12:45–1:00 p.m. Q&A**

## **1:00–1:15 p.m. Break**

## **1:15–4:15 p.m. *Why We Need Citizen and Community Engagement to Get Through the Next Pandemic Flu***

## **1:15–1:30 p.m. Introduction: *What Would a Modern-Day Flu Pandemic Look Like?***

What are the epidemiological predictions for a moderate-to-severe pandemic today? Is it realistic to expect that medical and public health interventions will thwart the broad impact of a novel flu virus? What are the most likely ethical and practical dilemmas that communities will face when trying to prevent additional infections and care for large numbers of sick people?

Eric Toner, MD, Senior Associate, Center for Biosecurity of UPMC; former Medical Director of Disaster Preparedness and Associate Head of Emergency Medicine, St. Joseph Medical Center, Baltimore, MD

## **1:30–2:20 p.m. Roundtable I: *Who Receives the Limited Doses of Pandemic Flu Vaccine? An Exercise in Shared Decision-Making***

Scarcity of life-saving medical supplies is one of the most complex issues facing policy-makers during a health emergency, in terms of medical outcomes, social stability, and confidence in government. How will policy deliberations adequately address the scientific and social values dimensions of the rationing dilemma? What are the benefits and challenges of seeking citizen input—in advance of the crisis—to decisions about how best to use limited doses of flu vaccine? What might citizen engagement offer mid-crisis if local conditions and vaccine supplies are out of synch with national guidelines? What are the risks if we do not engage the public?

Moderator: Peter A. Singer, MD, MPH, FRCPC, Director, University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics; Member, University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics Pandemic Influenza Working Group

Participants:

- Maggie Fox, Health and Science Correspondent, Reuters
- Peter B. Gudaitis, MDiv, Executive Director and CEO, New York Disaster Interfaith Services
- Dan Hanfling, MD, Director, Emergency Manager and Disaster Medicine, Inova Health System, Falls Church, Virginia
- Nelson Ortega, MBA, Executive Director, Centro de la Comunidad, Inc., Baltimore, Maryland
- Carol Jordan, RN, MPH, Director of Communicable Disease and Epidemiology, Montgomery County Department of Health and Human Services (Maryland)
- Arlene King, MD, MHSc, FRCPC, Director, Immunization & Respiratory Infections Division, Public Health Agency of Canada (PHAC); Co-Chair, PHAC's Pandemic Influenza Committee (invited)
- Sarah Landry, MS, Director, Public Policy for Vaccines, GlaxoSmithKline; former Associate Director of Policy and Program Operations, National Vaccine Program Office, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

## **2:20–2:45 p.m. Q&A**

## **2:45–3:00 p.m. BREAK**

### **3:00–3:50 p.m. Roundtable II: *What If Hospitals Cannot Take Everyone In? The Problem of Meeting Immense Medical Needs***

In a severe pandemic, demand for health care will be greater than the healthcare system's capacity to treat flu patients and maintain other essential medical services, according to everyday expectations. How can communities as a whole tackle the complex logistics of protecting the well and caring for the sick in large numbers? What might innovative partnerships among health agencies, hospitals, community-based organizations, businesses, and individual citizens—established in advance of the crisis—be able to accomplish in a mass casualty scenario?

Moderator: Tara O'Toole, CEO and Director, UPMC Center for Biosecurity

Participants:

- Ann Beauchesne, Executive Director, Homeland Security Division, U.S. Chamber of Commerce
- Arrietta Chakos, Assistant City Manager, City of Berkeley, California
- Christa-Marie Singleton, MD, MPH, Chief Medical Director, Office of Public Health Preparedness and Response, Baltimore City Health Department
- Jan Lane, Deputy Director, Homeland Security Policy Institute, George Washington University; former Vice President of Public Policy and Strategic Partnerships, American Red Cross, National Headquarters
- Diane Lapson, President, Independence Plaza North Tenant Association, Lower Manhattan, New York
- Robert Tosatto, RPh, MPH, MBA, Commander, U.S. Public Health Service, Director, Medical Reserve Corps Program, Office of the U.S. Surgeon General
- Richard Waldhorn, MD, Distinguished Scholar, Center for Biosecurity of UPMC; Clinical Professor of Medicine, Georgetown University; former Physician-in-Chief, Georgetown University Hospital

### **3:50–4:15 p.m. Q&A**

### **4:15–4:30 p.m. Concluding Remarks**

Tara O'Toole, MD, MPH and Monica Schoch-Spana, PhD

---

## **co-conveners**

Canadian Policy Research Network

The Center for Science, Technology and Security Policy,  
American Association for the Advancement of Science

National Consortium for the Study of Terrorism and Responses to Terrorism (START),  
a U.S. Department of Homeland Security University Center of Excellence

**Center for Biosecurity**  
**UPMC** | University of Pittsburgh  
Medical Center

621 East Pratt Street, Suite 210  
Baltimore, MD 21202  
443-573-3304

[www.upmc-biosecurity.org](http://www.upmc-biosecurity.org)

The audiotaped and transcribed  
proceedings of this conference will be  
available online by June 15, 2006.  
[www.upmc-biosecurity.org](http://www.upmc-biosecurity.org)